

## PCI Registered Reports #188: How Intelligence Interviewees Mentally Identify Relevant Information

### Recommender comments

Your clarifications are useful, but a key issue remains regarding analytic flexibility. The reason we ask for the design table is to make sure analytic and inferential flexibility are tied down. Your predictions could be confirmed or disconfirmed by relevant interactions; or by relevant partial interactions or simple effects; or by relevant pairwise comparisons. So what the Design Table needs to include is the key test of each hypothesis. Will you test interactions? Your analysis method involves using credibility intervals; so that necessitates one degree of freedom tests (hence, for example, the use of partial rather than full interactions when it comes to outcomes with more than two categories). Which contrasts will you do precisely? Will you test interactions before moving to simple effects? Under what conditions will you do that? What patterns of results will legitimate what conclusions? How will confidence ratings feed into your conclusions? Do any tests of them constitute a crucial test of any of your hypotheses?

In sum, for Stage 1 you want to have thought through the precise patterns that will confirm or disconfirm each hypothesis. Any analyses that do not crucially test your listed hypotheses should be left unstated at this time; they can be put in a non-pre-registered subsection of the Results.

---

Dear Zoltan,

Many thanks for recommending that we further eliminate analytic flexibility via the Study Design Template. The exercise was insightful! We have now revised the template (pages 30 - 31) to specify our hypotheses tests and patterns that would count as support. We had to revise the Study Design Template format to make the content wieldy. Doing so also required us to modify the wording of some hypotheses (see TRACK CHANGES), but the questions of interest remain consistent with the previous versions of the manuscript. Finally, we deleted the previous tables in the analysis plan as those tables are redundant with the Study Design Template.

Sincerely,  
Authors.