**Name: Siu Kit YEUNG**

**Review of Stage 1 Registered Report: Stress regulation via being in nature and social support in adults - a meta-analysis (Sparacio et al., 2021)**

**Disclosure**

I note that since Open Science is a large community, with lots of mass many-region/lab-author collaborations (see wyjdm.com for my list of many-region/lab/author work, e.g. Psychological Science Accelerator COVID-19, Creative Destruction of Science project), it is very possible I coauthored some of these projects together with some of the authors (including Hans Ijzerman, not sure about others). However, I was only involved in data collection/ethical approval/investigation plus reviewing/suggestions for changes (so two CREDIT roles only) in those mass many-region projects with 100+ authors. To the best of my knowledge, I have \*never\* contacted/talked to any of these authors \*individually\*, but we may have received the same emails from leaders of those team science projects. Sorry I just realized this issue after clicking the “accept” button. Feel free to let me know if this is not OK.

**Background**

Brief description of my background: I mainly focus on social-cognitive psychology, judgment and decision making research. I have a basic understanding of environmental psychology but I am not an expert in this area. I have some experiences in mental health research. I am familiar with meta-analyses, and I am working on [registered report templates for meta-analyses with Dr. Gilad Feldman and others](https://mgto.org/meta-analysis-registered-reports/). Feel free to refer to our templates/work if needed. Not a must.

**General Overview**

* Generally clear and transparent. Meaningful topic.
* I learned something new about publication biases tests and tools for meta-analyses. Thank you! I am grateful for this opportunity and learning experience.
* I suggest revision and resubmission, with relatively minor changes.
* The below are suggestions. It is up to you to adopt or not.

**Contributors**

1. Issue: It appears that [CRediT – Contributor Roles Taxonomy](https://casrai.org/credit/) is used, but no citation is provided.

* Suggestion: Please add citation (Allen & O’Connell, 2014) and provide the full name of CrediT there.

**Abstract**

1. Issue: I can’t find a statement regarding moderator analyses or subgroup analyses

* Suggestion: I believe it is better to add statements regarding these. It would be more interesting to read an Abstract with those elements.

**Introduction**

1. Issue: For the discussions regarding affective, physiological and cognitive consequences of stress, it appears the authors stated two studies of affective consequences, but only one study of physiological consequences and one study of cognitive consequences.

* Suggestion: It is probably better to be more balanced. Two studies for each perhaps.

1. Suggestion: Curious, are there null findings or mixed findings in the literature? It would be better to discuss those to communicate uncertainties in the literature
2. Issue: Great that issues regarding replication crisis are mentioned

* Suggestion: Would be better to add citations regarding replication issues in mental health or environmental psychology research, perhaps with examples if possible.

1. Issue: Great that possible differences between different conditions are discussed, but those descriptions are too brief in my opinion

* Suggestion: Add more specific information regarding those studies and theories, e.g. “stress recovery theory (Ulrich, 1983)” and Social Baseline Theory (e.g. Beckes & Coan, 2011; Coan & Sbarra, 2015)” (p. 8)

1. Issue: It appears no justification is provided regarding the minimum no. of studies needed for subgroup analyses, and it is not clear.

* Suggestion: Please explain why 10? Does this mean if there are 5 studies on physical social support and 15 studies on veral social support, subgroup comparison analyses won’t be concluded? So the minimum no. of \*each\* subgroup is 10?

**Method**

1. Issue: “Finally, we used social networks (Facebook Groups and Twitter) and mailing lists (SPSP, EASP, ESCAN)” (p. 10) – full names of mailing lists are not provided

* Sugggestion: Please provide full names

1. Issue: No justification for the exclusion critieria “participants were below 18 years of age” (p. 11)

* Suggestion: Please justify briefly

**Coding Sheet**

1. Issue: The “general coding” and “Main outcome” tabs are clear and well done, but there is no data tab (sorry if I misunderstand your coding sheet) with all the columns yet.

* Suggestion: I believe it is better to prepare in advance the data tab. You may check Yeung et al. (2021): <https://mgto.org/exp-ma-rr-template-coding> that we are developing. It is for experimental meta-analysis so feel free to adjust. It would be better to include columns for providing information about page numbers/justifications for coding.

1. Suggestion: It would be better to include a tab for article list, decision for inclusion/exclusion and record of contacting authors (see our template)

**R Code**

* Clear and transparent, well done!

1. Issue: The README is too brief: <https://github.com/alessandro992/Registered-report-meta-analysis/blob/main/README.md>

* Suggestion: Please provide filenames and information for all files

**References**

Allen, L., & O’Connell, A. (2014). CRediT - Contributor Roles Taxonomy. Retrieved May 13, 2020, from <https://casrai.org/credit/>

Beckes, L., & Coan, J. A. (2011). Social baseline theory: The role of social proximity in

emotion and economy of action. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass, 5*(12), 976–988.

Coan, J. A., & Sbarra, D. A. (2015). Social Baseline Theory: The social regulation of

risk and effort. *Current opinion in psychology, 1*, 87–91.

Sparacio, A., Ropovik, I., Jiga-Boy, G. M., & IJzerman, H. (2021, October 28). Stage 1 Registered Report: Stress regulation via being in nature and social support in adults - a meta-analysis. <https://doi.org/10.31234/osf.io/a4zmj>

Ulrich, R. S. (1983). Aesthetic and affective response to natural environment. In I. Altman &

J. F. Wohlwill (Eds.), *Behavior and the natural environment* (pp. 85–125). New York: Springer.

Yeung, S. K., Fillon, A. A., Protzko, J., Elsherif, M. M., Moreau, D., & Feldman, G. (2021, October 25). Experimental meta-analysis Registered Report template. https://doi.org/10.17605/OSF.IO/YTGRP