

## Review Reports (<https://osf.io/5q3pe>)

It is important to conduct replication studies under different conditions, and I believe this paper, which aims to achieve direct replication for the Bown et al. target paper for the first time, is very valuable. I myself conducted a replication study last year and published it in an international academic journal via PCI-RR. Drawing from that experience, I will propose several points for improvement and correction this time.

### Improvements

- Except for Stage 1 Snapshot, this paper briefly touches on Study 1 and Study 2 related to the Bown et al. target article for the first time in lines 173 to 175, but the content is only about the results, and at this stage, it is unclear what each scenario indicates. I think it is necessary to explain the scenarios beforehand.
- In general, it seems that the caption explanations in the Figures are insufficient. Particularly, Figures 1, 2, and 3 were presented without information on their scenarios, making it difficult to interpret the Figures.
- The line 176-177 of this paper states 'We summarised the designs of the three scenarios from Bown et al.'s (2003) Studies 1 and 2 in Figures 1 to 3,' but it seems that the actual Figures also include replication designs. This caused some confusion.
- The design of the online experiment form is very attractive, and I like it. Online implementation is well-suited for extensive data collection and can lead to cost reductions. However, transitioning experiments online could potentially deviate from the target article as much as randomizing all scenarios. While I'm not very knowledgeable about psychology, I feel that environmental factors can influence the level of concentration and motivation towards experiments. If reproducibility cannot be ensured, I believe it's important to address this issue as well.
- In preparation for this issue, it might be beneficial to include instructions within the online experiment form regarding creating an environment conducive to concentration, such as ensuring the absence of people nearby. Alternatively, it could be helpful to inquire about the experimental environment at the end of the form to ensure control over the experiment location.
- Furthermore, based on my experience, in online experiments, there have been instances where experiments could not continue due to Wi-Fi communication issues, or participants had to temporarily interrupt the experiment and resume it after some time. To ensure data acquisition, it is necessary to provide specific instructions regarding Wi-Fi environments and how to conduct the experiment.

## **Correction**

- Some parts of the 'Reason for change / Justifications' section in Table 9 were in bullet points (hyphens).

The methodology and analysis pipeline in other aspects were well thought out and meticulously designed. I believe it will be challenging to recruit over 1000 participants for the experiment, but I am looking forward to seeing the research results.